

ORIENTALIA CHRISTIANA PERIODICA

76 (2010), fasc. I-II

ISSN 0030-5375

ARTICOLI

- Gabriele Winkler**, Preliminary Observations about the Relationship between the Liturgies of St. Basil and St. James . . . . . 5-55

This contribution deals with selected themes, such as the concern for Orthodoxy and how this is reflected in the various redactions of the Liturgies of Basil and James; the praise of God by the angels and the community in the Oratio ante Sanctus; the Epiclesis and the Institution Narrative; including the Last Judgement at the Parousia, which forms part either of the Oratio post Sanctus or the Anamnesis; and the preparation for Communion, i.e. the Sancta sanctis-Cycle. These themes were investigated, for the first time, on the basis of a philological analysis of technical terminology contained in the various versions of the Liturgies of Basil and James, allowing thereby several preliminary observations about the interrelationship of the various redactions of two of the most prominent liturgies of entire Christendom.

- Oswaldo Raineri**, Herbert Weld Blundel: «The Royal Chronicle of Abyssinia 1769-1840». Indice dei nomi e delle citazioni bibliche . . . . . 57-83

The English traveller Herbert Weld Blundel (1852-1953) visited East Africa and Ethiopia in 1898, where he discovered that the Nile had been inaccurately located on the maps, and gathered hundreds of samples of indigenous birds that he donated to the British Museum. In Ethiopia again in 1905, he drew new maps, and studied the political system of the Oromo and the customs of the Berta population. On his return home he continued his studies of Ethiopica, some of which he published. His principal work was a Ge'ez edition with English translation of *The Royal Chronicle of Abyssinia 1769-1840*, which appeared in London in 1922. The present article publishes the "Index of Proper Names and Biblical Citations," absent in the original edition of Blundel.

- Robert Slesinski**, Bulgakov's Christological Synthesis: A Catholic Appreciation . . . . . 85-102

Bulgakov's Christological treatise is both an exposition and celebration of Divine-Humanity (*Bogochelovechestvo*). Taking as his point of departure the negative formulations of Chalcedon in regard to the two natures of Christ — "without confusion, without change, without division, without separation" — Bulgakov aspires to proffer a positive — kataphatic — articulation of the same. His "sophiological" Christology is premised on the ontological preconditions for the Incarnation that entail an eternal *kenōsis* of the Father in the act of creation that culminates in the hypostatization of the Logos in the Incarnation — a "primordial grace" — irrespective of the sin of Adam and man's subsequent redemption.

Bulgakov's Christology is thus an admirable synthesis of Logos and kenotic Christologies. Moreover, it entails a theological anthropology that only explicitates his fundamental intuition on the "co-imageness" between Divinity and humanity, namely, that "the kenosis of Divinity is also the apotheosis of humanity," man thereby being the "cryptogram of Divinity." His ontological frame of reference links him to the best of Catholic theological thought.

- Donato Bono**, La citazione di Is 53 nella *Prima Clementis* . . . . . 103-120

The presence of Is 53 in the New Testament writings via direct quotations as well as allusions, plus the fact that it was not ignored in early patristic literature, shows its particular importance in the tradition one could define as *Petrine* or *Jerusalem-Roman*. IClement is a privileged witness of that tradition, the final link in an identifiable chain

of Petrine discourses that extends from Acts 3:13,26; 4:27, 30 up to the hymn of 1Pet 2:22-25, and includes Mk 10:45; Heb 9:28 and Rom 10:16; 15:21, all writings that came from or were addressed to the Christian community in the imperial capital city of Rome.

One may affirm with reasonable certainty that the longest quotation of the Old Testament by Clement of Rome, a disciple of Peter and Paul, furnishes proof of the importance and particular interest the Petrine tradition gave to the theme of the *Suffering Servant*. This first complete quotation of Is 53 in a Christian text that could date to the beginning of AD 70 demonstrates the particularity of the theology of the *Suffering Servant* in the early Christian community.

**Joseph A. Munitiz, S.J.**, Leo of Ohrid: the new *Kephalaia* . . . . . 121-144

Presentation and English translation (accompanied by the Greek text) of a newly found collection of *Kephalaia* (spiritual chapters) published in the doctoral theses of Dr. Bütner (2007); attributed to Leo of Ohrid, these short sentences display a different aspect of an important eleventh century polemicist and Archbishop.

**Jonathan Loopstra**, The Trouble with ἐπιφέρετο: Basil's *Hexaemeron* 2.6 in Context . . . . . 145-160

Basil's appeal to a mysterious Syrian source in *Hexaemeron* 2.6 has rightfully attracted the attention of many earlier scholars. Little attention, however, has been given to the possible reasons why Basil chose to explain the meaning of the Semitic *Vorlage* instead of elucidating the LXX's ἐπιφέρετο in Genesis 1:2. This paper will show that there existed considerable ambiguity over the proper definition of this LXX reading among Basil's near contemporaries. As a sensitive pastor, Basil may have been aware of the ambiguities surrounding the use of ἐπιφέρετο in Genesis 1:2, causing him to turn to the interpretation of a Syrian exegete.

**Youhanna Nessim Youssef**, Psalis of the Myron . . . . . 161-180

Unlike other extant mss of the Rite of Preparation of the Holy Myron in the Coptic Church, the ms *Old Cairo Coptic Museum Lit. 253* does contain the text of the psalis chanted during the celebration of this rite. The present article edits critically for the first time the Coptic and Arabic texts of these chants, preceded by a description of the ms and followed by an English translation and detailed commentary on the texts and what can be gleaned from them for the history of the rite.

**George Nedungatt, S.J.**, Calamina, Kalamides, Cholamandalam. Solution of a Riddle . . . . . 181-199

According to several ancient Western sources, including the Roman Martyrology, St. Thomas the Apostle died a martyr in the city of Calamina in India. But Indian geography or history does not know any city by this name. In the new Barrington Atlas (2000), however, Calamina is shown as a city on the Bay of Bengal, while in the latest edition of the *Martyrologium Romanum* (2001) there is no more mention of Calamina. Calamina has long been a riddle. After a historical and philological enquiry the article examines critically the various solutions proposed. It resolves the riddle by showing that Calamina is the foreign form of the Tamil name for the Chola kingdom — not city — Cholamandalam, which survives as Choromandel.

**Robert F. Taft, S.J.**, Eucharistic Concelebration Revisited: Problems of History, Practice, and Theology in East and West. Part I . . . . . 277-313

Part I of this study revisits and updates what we know of the not always easily discovered varieties of eucharistic concelebration in East and West, past and present, before reviewing their historical origins and liturgico-theological rationale insofar as they can be discerned, before concentrating in part II on eucharistic concelebration in the Byzantine tradition via an analysis of its historical witnesses and an evaluation of its varieties, ritual, abuses, and theology today.

**George Nedungatt, S.J.**, India Confused with Other Countries in Antiquity? . . . . . 315-337

Although India belonged to the geography of Greek and Roman antiquity, there was also some confusion in identifying this country. It was sometimes confused, for example, with Ethiopia or Arabia. This confusion, which has been recently documented, was caused in part by Greek etymology: *aithiops* (= black-faced, dark) was applicable not only to the people of Ethiopia but to all other “coloured” people whether Indians or Arabians. However, this Greek etymology did not cause any real confusion in the minds of geographers, in the voyages of sailors, in the conquests of empire builders or in the travels of pilgrims or adventurers. The leading Fathers of the Church and ecclesiastical writers were well versed in ancient geography and distinguished clearly between India and Ethiopia. As regards the evangelization of these two countries, while in India there is a tradition about St. Thomas the Apostle, Ethiopia boasts of no such tradition being known for its evangelization by Frumentius in the fourth century.

**Vincenzo Ruggieri**, Addendum architettonico a Tristomon (Üçağız) e Pinara . . . . . 339-365

The essay on two sites, a village and a town of Lycia (Tristomon and Pinara), seeks to broaden and rectify what has hitherto been written about them. In the village of Tristomon, next to the large church built by the sea, a wide architectural complex comprising various rooms and organized structures, has been identified. One might hypothetically consider it a baptismal complex. The city of Pinara preserves an ecclesiastical area consisting of two churches; in a different urban quarter another church has been discovered. Whereas the first two churches were in a peripheral area of the lower city, the third is built on the fortified hill on the border of the eastern terrace overlooking the valley. Although the site is in need of archaeological excavation, the third church seems more likely to be the one built by Saint Nicholas of Sion at the time of his episcopate in the city.

**Gérard Colin**, Vie et miracles de Gabra Masqal . . . . . 367-387

In the intense wave of evangelization the province of Tigre underwent in the 14th c., the monastic movement played a seminal role. Gabral Masqal figures among the number of those offspring of prominent Christian families who embraced at an early age, still in childhood, the monastic life. He received a thorough religious formation and then, having become an accomplished monk, founded a monastery, gathered around himself numerous disciples, maintained close relations with other holy personages of the time, and kept in awe the sometimes aggressive civil powers. His *gadd*, with its resulting miracles, gives a clear picture of one of those “soldiers of God” that fashioned Medieval Ethiopia.

**Mariam de Ghantuz Cubbe**, La lettre du Patriarche Maronite Šamūn Butros de Ḥadet au Pape Léon X (1515) . . . . . 389-432

The Maronite patriarch Šamūn Butros of Ḥadet’s letter, written in the year 1515 to Pope Leo X, is one of the most ancient extant documents from a Maronite patriarch. The extent of the letter, including a profession of faith and a detailed report of many ceremonies and usages, and the fact that it was redacted at a time when the process of latinization had not yet taken hold, give it a remarkable value as a witness to the genuine Maronite tradition. This article presents a French translation from the Latin version, the letter’s sole surviving witness that has appeared in various editions, the last being that of the Maronite scholar Tobia Anaissi in 1921. A short commentary follows on the Trinitarian and Christological profession of faith included in the letter, and on the usage of the patriarchal name Peter. The author’s object is to make this interesting document accessible also to those who do not know Latin, and to invite other students interested in the Maronite Church to take note of it.

**Konstantinos Vetochnikov**, La suppression de la métropole de Caffa, au 17<sup>ème</sup> siècle . . . . . 433-457

In 1666, Caffa was the last of Crimea’s ecclesiastical dioceses under the Ecumenical Patriarchate to be suppressed before the Christian population of the peninsula moved to the Marioupol region. Caffa’s fate is symptomatic of the Christians’ conditions of life

under the Ottomans, and shares similarities with that of other regions of the former Byzantine Empire, in spite of the bishopric's peculiar situation on the frontier and its late foundation under foreign rule.

**Robert Slesinski**, *The Eternal Feminine, Androgyny, and the Meaning of Love in V. S. Solov'ev* . . . . . 459-476

In his short, but seminal, tract *The Meaning of Love (Smysl liubvi)*, Solov'ev proposes a number of theses regarding the nature of sexual love that have not only garnered the attention of philosophers-at-large, but proved influential in setting the stage for the *zhiznetvorchestvo* ("life-creation") movement as engaged in by Russian Symbolist poets and writers at the outset of twentieth-century Russia. On the one hand, Solov'ev is penetrating in his insights that stress the primacy of the personal and interpersonal over the merely biological and racial dimension of human sexuality. While, it is argued, he is correct in affirming that propagation and sexual love enjoy their own independent meaning with that of the latter not being merely reducible to its being a means for the former, Solov'ev, on the other hand, can be faulted for only positing an extrinsic relation between them without grasping the deep, *intrinsic* link that actually obtains between them on the level of a priori insight that, for its part, only serves to undergird a true *ontology* of human love.

Marred by a certain anti-procreative bias, Solov'ev's thought turns in the direction of androgyny as expressive of the true ideal of human love that transcends the masculine-feminine dichotomy, stressing as it does the creative dimension of man, intrinsic to human essence and evocative of a "perfect unity-of-the-all" (*vseedinstvo*) that points to the infinity proper to the human person. How these ideas find a clear echo in the subsequent thought of Nicolas Berdiaev is also shown in this study. More interesting, however, is the impact of Solov'ev's point of view on the Symbolist Movement, which was wont to underscore the very necessity of art not being restricted to art itself, but in being at one with life itself in any real effort at human authenticity, hence the new, programmatic term "*zhiznetvorchestvo*" that proclaims, at once, that the meaning of art lies in the creation of life or, more simply, in the words of Andrei Bely, that "life itself is creation." On the other hand, not free of Solov'ev's anti-procreative bias, the Symbolists also experimented in non-traditional marriage/family relationships in their quest for creativity.

### COMMENTARII BREVIORES

**Vasile Mărculeț**, *Un probable gouverneur du thème Paristrion-Paradounavon de la première partie du XI<sup>e</sup> siècle* . . . . . 201-208

**Philippe Luisier, S.J.**, *Les titres des kephalaia dans l'Évangile de Luc en copte saïdique. Au sujet d'un article récent* . . . . . 209-211

**Vincenzo Ruggieri**, *Atene e la parabola della filosofia: una nuova analisi* . . . . . 213-217

### RECENSIONES

BLUM, Georg Günter, *Byzantinische Mystik. Ihre Praxis und Theologie vom 7. Jahrhundert bis zum Beginn der Turkokratie, ihre Fortdauer in der Neuzeit* (R. Čemus) . . . . . 219-221

BOUCHER, Jean, *Viaggio in Terrasanta. Compendio italiano inedito del Bouquet sacré composé des plus belles fleurs de la Terre Sainte* (V. Poggi) . . . . . 221-224

CIANCAGLINI, Claudia A., *Iranian Loanwords in Syriac* (L. Alfieri) . . . . . 225-227

CRAGG, Kenneth, *Mosque Sermons. A Listener for the Preacher* (V. Poggi) 227-231

GETCHA, Job, <i>Le Typikon décrypté. Manuel de liturgie byzantine</i> (S. Hawkes-Teeple)	231-234
GIANOTTO, Claudio – Enrico NORELLI – Mauro PESCE, <i>L'enigma Gesù. Fonti e metodi della ricerca storica</i> (C. Marucci)	235-239
PETRÀ, Basilio, <i>La contraccizione nella tradizione ortodossa</i> (D. Salachas)	239-243
RUYSSEN, Georges-Henri, <i>Eucharistie et Œcuménisme. Évolution de la normativité universelle et comparaison avec certaines normes particulières. Canons 844/CIC et 671/CCEO</i> (G. Nedungatt)	243-245
STAVRAKOS, Christos – Alexandra-Kyriaki WASSILIOU – Mesrob K. KRICKORIAN, Hg., <i>Hypermachos. Studien zu Byzantinistik, Armenologie und Georgistik. Festschrift für Werner Seibt zum 65. Geburtstag</i> (M. Bais)	245-249
BACCI, Michele (dir.), <i>L'artista a Bisanzio e nel mondo cristiano-orientale</i> (M. Berger)	477-479
BORRMANS, Maurice, <i>Louis Gardet (1904-1986). Philosophe des cultures et témoin du dialogue islamo-chrétien</i> (V. Poggi)	479-480
BORRMANS, Maurice, <i>Prophètes du dialogue islamo-chrétien. Louis Massignon, Jean-Mohammed Abd-el-Jalil, Louis Gardet, Georges C. Anawati</i> (V. Poggi)	480-481
<i>Collezione Belvedere. Croci, icone e polittici russi di bronzo dal XV al XX secolo</i> (M. Berger)	481-483
<i>Collezione Belvedere. Icone datate e firmate dal XVIII al XX secolo</i> (M. Berger)	483-485
CRAGG, Kenneth, <i>A Christian-Muslim Inter-Text Now. From Anathemata to Theme</i> (V. Poggi)	485-489
CRAGG, Kenneth, <i>The Iron in the Soul. Joseph and the Undoing of Violence</i> (V. Poggi)	489-492
DI BRANCO, Marco, <i>Storie arabe di Greci e di Romani. La Grecia e Roma nella storiografia arabo-islamica medievale</i> (Ph. Luisier)	492-494
ELISEO L'ARMENO, <i>Sulla Passione, morte e risurrezione del Signore</i> (Ph. Luisier)	494-496
GONNEAU, Pierre, <i>À l'aube de la Russie moscovite. Serge de Radonège et André Roublev. Légendes et images (XIV<sup>e</sup>-XVII<sup>e</sup> siècles)</i> (M. Berger)	496-498
LARCHET, Jean-Claude, <i>L'iconographe et l'artiste</i> (M. Berger)	498-501
RIGO, Antonio – Pavel ERMILOV (ed. by), <i>Byzantine Theologians. The systematization of their own Doctrine and their Perception of foreign Doctrines</i> (A. Fyrigos)	502-506
SCARCIA AMORETTI, Biancamaria, <i>Il Corano. Una lettura</i> (V. Poggi)	506-507
SCOTTÀ, Antonio, <i>Papa Benedetto XV. La Chiesa, la grande guerra, la pace</i> (V. Poggi)	507-510
SHURGAIA, Gaga (a cura di), <i>Biobibliografia di Elene Met'reveli (1917-2003)</i> (Ph. Luisier)	510-512
ŠPIDLÍK, Card. Tomáš – Marko I. RUPNIK, <i>Una conoscenza integrale. La via del simbolo</i> (E. G. Farrugia)	512-515

SZEWczyk, Przemysław Marek, <i>Człowieczeństwo Logosu według Atanazego Wielkiego</i> (R. Zarzeczny) . . . . .	515-519
TEDROS ABRAHA (ed. and trans.), <i>I Gädl di Abunä Täwäldä-Mädehn e di Abunä Vittore</i> (Getachew Haile) . . . . .	519-526

## INDICATIONES

BAGNALL, Roger S., <i>Livres chrétiens antiques d'Égypte</i> (Ph. Luisier) . . .	249-250
BIANCHI, Luca, <i>Eucaristia ed ecumenismo. Pasqua di tutti i cristiani</i> (M. Pampaloni) . . . . .	251-252
<i>Бизнес и общество: Материалы V Международной научно-практической конференции, 20–22 января 2009 года</i> (R. Slesinski) . . . . .	253-254
HANN, Christopher and Paul Robert MAGOCSI, Eds., <i>Galicia: a multi-cultured land</i> (S. Senyk) . . . . .	254
LIEGGI, Jean Paul, <i>La cetra di Cristo. Le motivazioni teologiche della poesia di Gregorio di Nazianzo</i> (E. Cattaneo) . . . . .	254-257
LUTZKA, Carolina, <i>Die Kleinen Horen des byzantinischen Stundengebetes und ihre geschichtliche Entwicklung</i> (S. Parenti) . . . . .	257-259
KNECHTEN, Heinrich Michael, <i>Filaret von Moskau als geistlicher Schriftsteller</i> (T. Špidlík) . . . . .	259-260
KNECHTEN, Heinrich Michael, <i>Kraft in der Schwachheit — Dimitrij von Rostov</i> (T. Špidlík) . . . . .	259-260
MEYENDORFF, Paul, <i>The Anointing of the Sick</i> (R. F. Taft) . . . . .	261-262
MOUKARZEL, Joseph, <i>Gabriel Ibn al-Qilā'ī († ca 1516). Approche biographique et étude du corpus</i> (A. Girard) . . . . .	262-264
OHME, Heinz, Hg., <i>Concilium Quinisextum: Das Konzil Quinisextum</i> (G. Nedungatt) . . . . .	264-267
ROSSO, Stefano, <i>Un popolo di Sacerdoti. Introduzione alla liturgia</i> (J. R. de Melo) . . . . .	267-269
SALACHAS, Dimitrios, <i>La vita consacrata nel Codice dei Canoni delle Chiese Orientali (CCEO)</i> (J. Abbass) . . . . .	269-270
СЕМЕHOB, H. C., <i>Философская и богословская антропология: Очерки</i> (R. Slesinski) . . . . .	270-271
SOLOVIEV, Vladimir, <i>I tre dialoghi e Il Racconto dell'Anticristo</i> (T. Špidlík) . . . . .	271-273
TEULE, Herman, <i>Les Assyro-chaldéens</i> (P. Yousif) . . . . .	273-274
BABINI, Giuliana – Giovanni RAFFA – Laura RENZI, <i>La Vergine della tenerezza di Vladimir. Per una spiritualità del Dio vicino</i> (M. Berger) . . . . .	526-527
BARMIN, A. V., <i>Polemika i Schisma. Istorija greko-latinskich sporov IX-XII vekov</i> (G. Podskalsky) . . . . .	527-528
GASPARI, Anna, <i>Ricco sposo della Povertà. Ufficio liturgico italogreco per Francesco d'Assisi</i> (A. Fyrigos) . . . . .	528-529
HARRISON, Nonna Verna, <i>God's Many-Splendored Image: Theological Anthropology for Christian Formation</i> (E. G. Farrugia) . . . . .	530-531

KANNOOKADAN, Pauly, ed., <i>Syro-Malabar Church Forty Years After the Vatican Council II</i> (G. Nedungatt) . . . . .	532-533
KAROTEMPREL, Bishop Gregory, ed., <i>A Cry in the Wilderness</i> (G. Nedungatt) . . . . .	533
РУДЕНКО, Ю. К. (под ред.), <i>Русская история и культура: Статьи. Воспоминания. Эссе, Сборник статей, «Наука», Санкт-Петербург 2007, 392 с.</i> (R. Slesinski) . . . . .	533-535
SABUGAL, Santos, <i>Il Padre nostro. Commento antologico e catechetico</i> (V. Poggi) . . . . .	535-536
TODARO, Madre Teresa, <i>Maria Caterina Troiani</i> (V. Poggi) . . . . .	537-538
TODARO, Madre Teresa, <i>Lo schiavismo in Egitto nel XIX secolo e l'opera del riscatto delle morette africane</i> (V. Poggi) . . . . .	537-538