

**ORIENTALIA CHRISTIANA PERIODICA**  
**82 (2016), fasc. I-II**  
**ISSN 0030-5375**

**ARTICOLI**

<b>Emidio Vergani</b> , Ricordo di mons. Pierre Yousif . . . . .	5-10
<b>Gabriele Winkler</b> , Über das „Dignum et iustum“, seine Varianten und den nachfolgenden Lobpreis . . . . .	11-40

The present contribution deals with the investigation of the Greek, Syriac and Armenian texts of the “Dignum et iustum”, its variants and their significance. The following witnesses were analysed: the wording of the “Dignum et iustum” in the various versions of the Anaphoras of Basil and James, the East-Syrian evidence of the Anaphoras of the Apostles Addai and Mari, of Nestorius and Theodore of Mopsuestia, including the maronite *Šarrar* (= syr Pet III), in addition the formulation in several West-Syrian Anaphoras. The “Dignum et iustum” (ἄξιον καὶ δίκαιον) normally concludes the Opening Dialogue and is then repeated at the beginning of the Oratio ante Sanctus where it forms the bridge to the praise of God by the faithful, so all the versions of Basil and James. The most significant exceptions of this pattern include not only the two Armenian versions of the Basilius-Anaphora but also the East-Syrian Anaphoras and syr Pet III. These Syriac and Armenian Anaphoras deviate significantly from the other witnesses. Analysing the “Dignum et iustum” (ἄξιον καὶ δίκαιον) we have to distinguish the genuine differences in the vocabulary from those additions which merely reflect an emphasis by repetitions or additions of the vocabulary adopted from other traditions. The following terms were investigated, the most important being:

— first and foremost the “*decens*” (πρέπον), normative for the East-Syrian tradition as: ܕܥܨܘܢܐ (cf. West-Syr: ܕܥܨܘܢܐ); arm: Գարեբի է (πρέπει), which has to be distinguished from:

ἄξιον (“*dignum*”) of the other traditions;

— “*dignum*” (ἄξιον), syr: ܕܥܨܘܢܐ;

— “*iustum*” (δίκαιον), syr: ܕܕܝܩܝܘܢܐ;

Moreover, the presence or absence of these terms, including their combinations and the significance of this evidence were closely investigated.

Finally, normally the verb(s) of praise (respectively: “Gloria tibi” [ܘܕܢܘܨܢܐ ܕܘܒܝܢܐ]) emanate out of the “Dignum et iustum”, yet there are traditions where the verb(s) of praise are not linked to the “Dignum et iustum”, as is the case in both Armenian versions of the Anaphora of Basil, which seemingly have something to do with the early East-Syrian tradition.

<b>Daniel Oltean</b> , Le rituel monastique byzantin du <i>πρόσχημα</i> . Histoire d’une évolution inattendue . . . . .	41-66
---	-------

The Byzantine monastic ritual of *πρόσχημα*: History of an unexpected evolution  
The article focuses on the meaning of the word *πρόσχημα* in the Byzantine monastic environment. A primary group of literary and canonical texts of the first Christian millennium, of a Constantinopolitan origin usually, gives the word a

double meaning: the habit worn by monks, and the ritual whereby the monks received this habit. On the other hand, the analysis of several liturgical texts from the 11th to the 14th centuries shows that the *πρόσχημα* was often seen to be a habit of the novice or an intermediate garment between the novice's habit and the *μέγα σχήμα*. Moreover, after the 14th century, the word would cease to be part of the monastic liturgical language.

In order to explain this transformation, the article examines several hagiographic texts of the 9th to the 11th centuries: among them, the *Life* of Euthymios the Younger, which indicates two successive garments of the saint in *πρόσχημα*, and the *Lives* of Athanasius the Athonite and of Lazarus of Mt. Galesion. All these *Lives* contain similar elements when their protagonists make the transition from the monastic environment of Constantinople to the Palestinian or Athonite one. The solution given by this analysis is simple: the interaction that took place from the 8th to the 11th centuries between the Constantinopolitan *πρόσχημα* and the Palestinian *μέγα σχήμα* led to the transformation of the former into a secondary habit in the monastic hierarchy which would later be named *μικρόν σχήμα*.

**Ugo Zanetti**, Questions liturgiques dans les « Canons de Shenoute » . 67-99

Thanks to B. Layton's edition of « The Canons of Shenoute », it has become possible to define in a much more detailed way how the prayer services were conducted in the « Congregation of Shenoute », which included the White Monastery, the Red Monastery and « the Monastery in the Village », i.e., a female community member of this congregation, which was located near Sohag (Upper Egypt). This not only explains the everyday life in this 5th century cenobitic congregation, but also helps to solve some riddles about the Pachomian liturgy, particularly the so-called « six prayers » — a feature typical of the Upper Egyptian monastic prayer, which entirely disappeared after the first millenium —, as well as some peculiarities of the burial services, and of the fasting practice.

**Brouria Bitton-Ashkelony and Sergey Minov**, “A Person of Silence”:

Philoxenos of Mabbug, Letter of Exhortation Sent to Someone Who Left Judaism and Came to the Life of Perfection . . . . .

101-125

The article publishes the original Syriac text of the “Letter of exhortation sent to someone who left Judaism and came to the life of perfection,” addressed to a fellow monk by the West-Syrian bishop of Mabbug Philoxenos (5th/6th cc.). The letter, published on the basis of manuscript British Library Add. 14,726, is accompanied with an English translation and discussion of its ascetic worldview in the context of Philoxenos' writings.

**Rafał Zarzeczny, S.J.**, *The Story of Paul the Simple* from the *Historia Lausiaca* by Palladius in its Ethiopic Recension . . . . .

127-178

It is well known that the vast majority of ancient Christian writings have been translated into Ethiopic (Gəʿəz) from their oriental versions and some only directly from the original Greek texts. This is also true with regard to monastic and hagiographic literature. A number of hagiographic works, ascetical treatises, monastic rules, and collections of sayings of the Desert Fathers, often gathered within Syriac collections, such as, the *Paradise* or *Garden of the Fathers*, and later translated into Arabic, were freely used starting from the 14th century

within several Ethiopic monastic collections, such as, the *Mäṣṣhafä zēnahomū lä-abäw*, the *Gadlä abäw qəddusan*, and the *Mäṣṣhaftä mänäkosat*. This article discusses the popular story about Saint Paul, a disciple of Saint Anthony, taken from the *Lausiac History* by Palladius (CPG 6036) as a case study. An Ethiopic version of its integral text was found only in two manuscripts: EMMML 1844 (A) and BL Or. 692 (B; the text is not mentioned in Wright's *Catalogue*). A textual analysis of the Ethiopic version leads to the conclusion that the document could have been translated directly from a Greek archetype, presumably during the Aksumite era. After the introduction, this article includes the edition of the Ethiopic text and its translation into English.

**Ioana Feodorov**, *Les Firanğ – Francs, Européens ou catholiques? Témoignage d'un chrétien syrien du XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle* . . . . .

179-210

While accompanying his father Makarius III Ibn al-Za'im, Patriarch of Antioch, in Eastern Europe in 1652-1658, Paul of Aleppo (Bülos b. al-Za'im al-Ḥalabiyy) met with people and realities that he described as *Ifranğ* and *Ifranğiyi* in his *Journal*, preserved in the longest form (322 fol. r/v) in *Ms. Arabe 6016* of Bibliothèque nationale de France in Paris. The article chiefly addresses the semantic content of derivatives of the 4-consonant root *f-r-n-ğ*, established in Arabic through a loan from a non-Semitic language. The purpose in this paper is to show, using the examples from Paul of Aleppo's *Journal*, that the term *Ifranğ* has more meanings than those commonly recorded in dictionaries ('Frank', 'European'), including 'Western', 'foreigner', 'Italian', 'excellent', 'of superior quality', and, more importantly, 'Latin' and 'catholic'. Seldom investigated in lexicographic works, these meanings reveal the richness of the notion of 'Frank' in medieval and pre-modern literatures of the Middle East, concerning various fields of culture and society.

**Marek Dospěl**, *The Wādī al-Naṭrūn Monasteries and a Reassessment of the Manuscript *Itinerarium* (c. 1765) of Remedius Prutký OFM*

211-226

The area of ancient Skētis (modern Wādī al-Naṭrūn) about 100 km NW of Cairo was once home to thousands of eremites and coenobitic monks. Even though considerably diminishing in numbers over the course of the middle ages and the early modern era, the monastic foundations there retained their prominent status playing, ultimately, an important role in the Europe's "discovery" of the Coptic Christianity. The ancient monasteries attracted numerous Western visitors to Wādī al-Naṭrūn beginning in the seventeenth century; men of letters and representatives of Western Christianity would eventually record their personal experiences, among them a Franciscan missionary, Remedius Prutký (1713-1770). The present essay focuses on Prutký's account of Wādī al-Naṭrūn in his manuscript *Itinerarium*. While the blatant similarities between Prutký's work and a manuscript by another Franciscan missionary, Jakub Římař (1682-1755), were first observed in the 1940s, my present close examination of Prutký's alleged visit to Wādī al-Naṭrūn reveals substantial problems as to the veracity of this particular account, which appears to have been most likely plagiarized from a text published by a Jesuit missionary, Claude Sicard, in 1717. Since I first presented these findings in 2008, I published two more case studies (in 2009 & 2010) on two other accounts in Prutký's *Itinerarium* that demonstrate the author's tacit use of published texts in composing his own. These findings allow me to arrive, in the latter part of the present essay, to a substantial reassessment of Prutký's

*Itinerarium* as a work of highly problematic authenticity, a lucid example of the complex history of textual transmission.

**Edward G. Farrugia, S.J.**, *In memoriam*. P. Vincenzo Poggi, S.J. (1928-2016), Direttore di OCP dal 1976 al 2004 e dal 2010 al 2012 277-284

**Gabriele Winkler**, Über die armenischen liturgischen Gesänge erläutert anhand der armenischen Begriffe mit ihren georgischen Parallelen . . . . . 285-305

In most previous investigations concerning the evolution of the Armenian liturgical chants and the pertinent terminology the Georgian parallels were not included in the research although they often assist in clarifying the Armenian evidence. This investigation deals with the 5th cent. vocabulary connected with the execution of the Psalmody and the OT-Cantica of the Cathedral Office, including the Cathedral Vigil in the Armenian Lectionary, the Georgian collection of troparia, the Iadgari, and the Georgian Lectionary, demonstrating the close parallels of the Armenian and Georgian liturgical terms. Later on chants began to accompany also liturgical actions during the liturgy as, for example, the transfer of bread and wine, witnessed in the 7th to 8th Armenian evidence in Step'anos Siwnec'i and its Georgian parallels: both do not only show close structural affinity with each other, but concerning the respective terminology as well: the Armenian *čašažam* / „Midday-Hour“ corresponds exactly to the Georgian eucharist celebrated on the day of high feasts, referred to as *samhrad* / „at Midday“ in the Iadgari and the Georgian Lectionary. The Armenian entry-psalm associated with the term *hakaraku'iwn* can be compared to the Georgian *ohit'ay*, and the troparion which accompanies the transfer of bread and wine, the Armenian *srbasac'ut'iwn* and the Georgian *sicmidisay*, have both their roots in Is 6:3. In order to follow the presentation of the evidence, the Armenian, Georgian, Greek, and Syriac parallels were listed at the end with the respective research.

**Henryk Pietras, S.J.**, “La guerra di Costantinopoli”. La posizione politico dottrinale dei vescovi alessandrini dopo il Concilio di Calcedonia . . . . . 307-351

This article takes up the theme of the post-Chalcedonian discussions between the so-called Dyophysites and Monophysites, examining them in the context of the struggle of the Church of Alexandria and other Eastern Churches against the dominance of Constantinople. At the Council of Chalcedon (451) Constantinople obtained prerogatives heretofore unheard of and contrary to the requirements of the Council of Nicaea. The theological language of Chalcedon was orthodox for the Latins, but when translated into Greek proved to be inaccurate, because the Latin *natura* did not correspond fully to the Greek *physis*. Pope Leo himself realized this in the following years and tried to change the language, as evidenced especially in his letter (165) to Emperor Leo I the Thracian, but it became increasingly clear that the real problem was not theology but politics and ambitions. The See of Alexandria, which at the council lost its rank of prominence among the Eastern Churches, had taken advantage of this ambiguity to reject — using as a pretext doctrinal reasons — what hurt her most, namely, the primacy of Constantinople. The lack of flexibility of the Roman Church,

repeatedly misled by Oriental intrigues, did not help to form a compromise and in consequence the Church of Alexandria separated from the Universal Church.

**Bishara Ebeid**, The Christology of the Church of the East. An Analysis of Christological Statements and Professions of Faith of the Official Synods of the Church of the East before A.D. 612 . . . . .

353-402

The Church of the East, even if it was outside the Byzantine Empire and did not take part in the Christological discussions and controversies there, could not be silent. Our analysis of the Christological statements and professions of faith shows the reaction of this Church to the Christological controversies. These statements demonstrate this Church's own progress in Christological thought, its way of responding to the most important Christological questions, in two different Christological currents: the *qnomā-paršopā* current and the two-*qnomē* current. This analysis could help scholars understand better the development of the Christology of this Church before the assembly of bishops in 612 and her "Nestorianization," namely, the doctrine of two *kyanē* (natures) and two *qnomē* (hypostases) in the one *paršopā* (persona) of Christ. This analysis could also assist scholars who study the Christology of the Church of the East after the year 612, since the controversy between the two different Christological currents did not stop with the victory of the two-*qnomē* movement in 612.

**Pietro D'Agostino**, La légende du miracle de l'image de Tibériade (BHO 450) et la fondation monastique de Mār Ḥaninā: un regard croisé sur les sources . . . . .

403-420

The aim of the article is to identify the location of a Syriac monastery known so far only through literary sources. In the first part the author analyses a hagiographic legend concerning a miraculous image of Christ performing miracles in Tiberias, with a particular focus on the relationship between this legend and the foundation of a monastery known under the name of St. Ananias. In the second part, the article focuses on various literary witnesses of this monastery in Syriac and Arabic sources, namely John of Ephesus, Bar Hebraeus, Michael the Syrian and Theodore Abū Qurrah. Between the locations that have been proposed for this monastery, the desert between Bālis and Callinicum (modern al-Raqqah) is ultimately the most likely. In the final part of the article, the relationships between the miracle tale and the iconodoule propaganda are considered, paying a particular attention to the narrative setting (Tiberias) and to its fame as birthplace of the iconoclastic heresy according to orthodox heresiology.

**Dorothea McEwan**, The wall paintings of Dāräsge Maryam Church, in the Sämen Mountains, Ethiopia, and in particular the painted procession on the east wall . . . . .

421-450

Dāräsge Maryam Church, in the Sämen Mountains, Ethiopia, was built by *Däḡḡazmač* Wəbe Haylä Maryam as his coronation church. He richly endowed it with liturgical vestments and objects. The church was consecrated in 1852 and embellished with wall paintings on the four sides of the inner sanctum, the *mäqdäs*. The paintings on the east wall show a procession or gathering of a great mass of people, musicians, political leaders and church leaders. Except of

Wabe, who is named in a caption, the four other painted dignitaries remained unnamed. The article presents a detailed description of this procession or gathering and for the first time suggests names and ranks for the four dignitaries.

**Mario Carolla**, Due confessori della fede . . . . . 451-476

Among the Catholics who have been persecuted for their faith in the former USSR, the faithful of the Armenian rite comprise one small but significant community. This paper tells the story of two Armenian priests, Pietro Alagian and Dionigi Kalatosoff, who were persecuted by the communist regime. They stand among the most authentic witnesses of the faith. Indeed, because they were not martyred, their fidelity to the Church endured the test of prolonged suffering.

### ANIMADVERSIONES

**Dimitrios Zaganas**, The Problem of Named Sources in Anastasius Sinaita's *Hexaemeron* . . . . . 227-237

**Vincenzo Ruggieri**, Short Remarks on Byzantine Heraclea Sebaces 239-242

**Sergey Kim**, Δι' ἰβηρικῶν γραμμᾶτων. Georgians at the Philotheou Monastery on Mount Athos? . . . . . 477-481

### RES BIBLIOGRAPHICA

**Marek Starowieyski**, Grégoire Péradzé – patrologue géorgien. À l'occasion de la publication des œuvres complètes . . . . . 243-249

**Michel Fédou**, *La théologie byzantine et sa tradition I/1 (VI<sup>e</sup>-VII<sup>e</sup> s.)*. Sous la direction de Carmelo Giuseppe Conticello, (Brepols, Turnhout, 2015) . . . . . 483-490

### RECENSIONES

CATALDI, Antonio, *Le missioni cattoliche italiane nelle colonie d'Etiopia e d'Eritrea*. Presentazione di Mario Belardinelli (G. H. Ruysen) . . 251-254

GREISIGER, Lutz, *Messias – Endkaiser – Antichrist. Politische Apokalyptik unter Juden und Christen des Nahen Ostens am Vorabend der arabischen Eroberung* (Orientalia Biblica et Christiana, Bd. 21) (G. L. Potestà) . . . . . 254-258

GUTAS, Dimitri, *Avicenna and the Aristotelian Tradition: Introduction to reading Avicenna's Philosophical Works*. Second, Revised and Enlarged Edition, Including an Inventory of Avicenna's Authentic

Works (Islamic Philosophy, Theology and Science – Texts and Studies, Vol. 89) (L. Basanese) .....	258-260
IVANOV, Vjačeslav, <i>Povest' o Svetomire Careviče</i> [Вячеслав Иванов, <i>Повесть о Светомире царевиче</i> ], edizione preparata da A. A. Toporkov, O. L. Fetisenko, A. B. Šiškin (S. Caprio) .....	260-262
KLUG, Stefan, <i>Alexandria und Rom. Die Geschichte der Beziehungen zweier Kirchen in der Antike</i> (Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, Ergänzungsband, Kleine Reihe 11) (Ph. Luisier) .....	262-266
SCHULZE WESSEL, Martin – SYSYN, Frank E. (eds.), <i>Religion, Nation, and Secularization in Ukraine</i> (V. Adadurov) .....	266-269
WEIBEL YACoub, Claire, <i>Le rêve brisé des Assyro-Chaldéens. L'introuvable autonomie</i> (G. H. Ruysen) .....	269-273
DE GIORGIO, Teodoro, <i>San Teodoro. L'invincibile guerriero. Storia, culto e iconografia</i> (R. Iacopino) .....	491-493
ÉVAGRE LE SCHOLASTIQUE, <i>Histoire ecclésiastique</i> (H. Pietras) .....	493-495
GRUNDMANN, Regina – KATTAN, Assaad Elias (Hg.), <i>Jenseits der Tradition? Tradition und Traditionskritik in Judentum, Christentum und Islam</i> (E. G. Farrugia) .....	495-499
JACOBSEN, Anders-Christian (a cura di), <i>Origeniana Undecima. Origen and Origenism in the History of Western Thought. Papers of the 11th International Origen Congress, Aarhus University, 26/31 August 2013</i> (H. Pietras) .....	499-501
PETTINAROLI, Laura, <i>La politique russe du Saint-Siège (1905-1939)</i> (S. Caprio) .....	501-504
RAMSEY, John (Patrick), <i>The Minor Clergy of the Orthodox Church: Their role and life according to the canons</i> (E.-I. Roman) .....	504-506
YACoub, Joseph & Claire, <i>Oubliés de tous. Les Assyro-Chaldéens du Caucase</i> (G. H. Ruysen) .....	506-511